

From: Fritsch, Mark
Sent: Thursday, July 18, 2013 12:02 PM
To: F&W State Staff; F&W Plus
Cc: Schrepel, Eric
Subject: FW: ISRP follow-up: CTUIR Biomonitoring of Fish Enhancement (#2009-014-00)

All,

As a follow-up to the previous review and conditions placed on this project – please see email string below. The project continues to perform and address the conditions placed on the project. As presented to the ISRP during the Geographic Review - the next condition (i.e., progress report) will be submitted in 2015. If you have any questions please let me know. Mark

From: Merrill, Erik
Sent: Wednesday, July 17, 2013 4:39 PM
To: Grover, Tony; Fritsch, Mark; Merrill, Erik
Subject: ISRP follow-up: CTUIR Biomonitoring of Fish Enhancement (#2009-014-00)

Tony and Mark,

In response to the ISRP's review ([2012-17](#)) of the Confederated Tribes of the Umatilla Indian Reservation's (CTUIR) *Biomonitoring of Fish Enhancement* project (#2009-014-00), the Council recommended to Bonneville Power Administration that the Tribes address the ISRP's two recommended qualifications. Specifically, the Council and the ISRP asked that the Tribes 1) provide a progress report for ISRP review within three years and 2) during the Geographic Review, present additional information and allow time to discuss questions raised in the ISRP's 2012 review.

On April 25, 2013, the project sponsor, Gene Shippentower and team, presented to the ISRP and specifically addressed each ISRP concern point by point (see the attached presentation). The presentation addressed the ISRP's immediate concerns, documented progress on the project's design, and demonstrated a constructive approach to peer review. Thus, the ISRP finds that the second qualification is met. During the presentation, the project sponsor stated that the first qualification would be addressed by a progress report describing the project's implementation and results from 2013-2015. The ISRP looks forward to reviewing that report when completed.

During the Geographic Review response loop, the ISRP's also looks forward to gaining more information from the habitat restoration projects of how this biomonitoring project is integrated with and used to evaluate their restoration efforts.

Sincerely,

Erik Merrill for Greg Ruggerone, ISRP Chair, and Rich Alldredge, Geographic Review Lead

From: Fritsch, Mark
Sent: Friday, November 30, 2012 12:47 PM
To: Council Members
Cc: F&W State Staff; F&W Plus; Schrepel, Eric
Subject: RE: ISRP Review of the project Biomonitoring of Fish Enhancement (#2009-014-00)

Council Members,

Project #2009-014-00, *Biomonitoring of Fish Habitat Enhancement* - Staff have been monitoring the follow-up submittal to the ISRP required by the Council regarding this project. The CTUIR has addressed the Council's condition as expressed in the recent ISRP review (ISRP document 2012-17). The associated conditions can be addressed in contracting and as part of the upcoming Geographic Review. If you have any questions please let me know. Mark

Background

As you will note below, the ISRP's review of the follow-up material (i.e., study design) provided by the Confederated Tribes of the Umatilla Indian Reservation's (CTUIR), has meet science review criteria with qualifications. This follow-up review for Project #2009-014-00, *Biomonitoring of Fish Habitat Enhancement* was initiated by a condition placed on this project by the Council as part of the Research, Monitoring and Evaluation and Artificial Production Categorical Review as follows.

"Implementation recommendation beyond FY 2012 depends on ISRP review of study"

Based on the favorable ISRP review (ISRP document 2012-17), the condition placed on this project has been meet. This recommendation is conditioned on the CTUIR providing a report to the ISRP for ISRP review within three years, and providing additional information and clarity to questions raised (i.e., Condition 2, item *a – j*) during the geographic review. Council staff has discussed these conditions with the CTUIR and they support both conditions. Arrangements will be made as part of the upcoming geographic review for the CTUIR to present additional detail responding to the questions raised by the ISRP (Tentative date is for the week of April 22nd, 2013).

From: Merrill, Erik
Sent: Tuesday, November 20, 2012 5:13 PM
To: Council Members; F&W State Staff; F&W Plus; Schrepel, Eric
Subject: ISRP Review of the project Biomonitoring of Fish Enhancement (#2009-014-00)

Council Members and Fish and Wildlife Staff,

In response to the Northwest Power and Conservation Council's October 15, 2012 request, the ISRP reviewed the document *Biological Effectiveness Monitoring and Evaluation Plan for Fisheries Habitat Enhancement in CTUIR Subbasins* (draft report, August 2012), which was produced for the Confederated Tribes of the Umatilla Indian Reservation's (CTUIR)

Biomonitoring of Fish Enhancement project (#2009-014-00). As described in the CTUIR cover letter, this plan was developed to evaluate CTUIR fish habitat restoration projects throughout five subbasins: the Grande Ronde, John Day, Tucannon, Umatilla, and Walla Walla Rivers.

This is a follow-up to the ISRP's review of the project in the Research, Monitoring and Evaluation and Artificial Production Categorical Review in 2010 ([ISRP 2010-44A](#)). The ISRP found that the project met scientific review criteria (qualified). The qualification was that the ISRP review the project's experimental design once it was completed. The Council concurred with the ISRP's recommendation and recommended that an *"implementation recommendation beyond FY 2012 depends on ISRP review of study design"* ([Final Council Decision, June 2011](#)).

The ISRP finds that the plan "Meets Scientific Review Criteria (Qualified)" with two qualifications:

- 1) The proponents should prepare and submit an interim report to the ISRP for review within three years. The report should contain a summary of data collected, results, and program modifications.
- 2) The proponents should make a presentation to the ISRP during the upcoming Geographic Review in which requested information is provided and time is allowed for a clarifying discussion on issues raised in this review.

See the attached memo for details.

Sincerely,

Erik

Erik Merrill
Manager, Independent Scientific Review Program
Northwest Power and Conservation Council
851 SW 6th Avenue, Suite 1100
Portland, Oregon 97204
503-222-5161
800-452-5161 (toll-free)